

OAQPS Economic Analysis Resource Document

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards
Innovative Strategies and Economics Group

April 1999

This document is intended to be a resource for understanding and performing economic analyses by OAQPS economists. This document should not be interpreted as guidance that will be followed exactly by OAQPS in its analyses. Each analysis performed by OAQPS presents unique features, so this guidance is only advisory in nature. This document will need to be revised to reflect changes in EPA's approach to implementing statutory or administrative requirements and to clarify and update text if the document is to continue to be a helpful resource. This document was prepared for Thomas Walton of the Innovative Strategies and Economics Group of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards. The document was prepared by Research Triangle Institute (RTI), Center for Economics Research, Research Triangle Park, NC. Primary authors from RTI are Brian C. Murray, Tayler H. Bingham, Tyler J. Fox, and A. Brett Hauber. Publication support was coordinated by Sharon M. Barrell. V. Kerry Smith of Duke University provided review comments on the general methodology section of the document. Parts of this document are based on modifications of a similar economic analysis guidance document prepared by RTI for EPA's Office of Pollution Prevention and Toxics, Economic Policy and Analysis Branch.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Section</u>		<u>Page</u>
1	Introduction	1-1
1.1	Regulatory Context	1-1
1.2	Different Levels of Economic Analysis in OAQPS	1-3
1.2.1	Stages of Analysis: Proposal versus Final Rule	1-4
1.3	Scope of This Document	1-5
1.4	Organization of This Document	1-6
2	Regulatory Background	2-1
2.1	OAQPS's Regulatory Authority	2-1
2.2	Statutory and Administrative Requirements for Economic Analysis of Regulations	2-2
2.2.1	Clean Air Act	2-4
2.2.2	Executive Order 12866	2-5
2.2.3	Statutes and Executive Orders Requiring "Impact Analysis" ..	2-6
2.2.3.1	Impacts on State, Local, and Tribal Governments ...	2-11
2.2.3.2	Small Entity Impacts	2-12
2.2.3.3	Reporting and Recordkeeping Requirements	2-13
2.2.3.4	Impacts on Children	2-14
2.2.3.5	Impacts on Low-Income and Minority Populations	2-15
2.3	Summary	2-16
3	The Regulatory Development Process	3-1
3.1	EPA Regulatory Development Process	3-1
3.1.1	Start Action Notice	3-3
3.1.2	Workgroup Formation	3-3
3.1.3	Early Guidance from Senior Management	3-4
3.1.4	Analytical Blueprint	3-4

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONTINUED)

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
3.1.5 Preliminary Analysis, Regulatory Options Development, and Selection of Alternatives	3-4
3.1.6 Rule Preparation and Workgroup Closure	3-5
3.1.7 OMB Review	3-6
3.1.8 Administrator's Signature and FR Publication of Proposed Rule	3-6
3.1.9 Public Comment, Rule Revision, and Signature and Publication of Proposed Rule	3-7
3.1.10 Rule Revision, Signature, and Publication of the Final Rule ..	3-7
3.2 Economic Analysis in Regulatory Development	3-7
3.2.1 Overview of Analysis Activity	3-7
3.2.2 A Note on Cost/Control Strategy Analysis for NAAQS	3-9
3.2.3 Structure and Content of ISEG Reports	3-11
3.3 Specific ISEG Tasks in the Regulatory Development Process	3-13
3.3.1 Initial Screening	3-13
3.3.2 Scoping Assessment and SBREFA Determination	3-14
3.3.3 Industry Profile	3-15
3.3.4 Analysis Plan	3-15
3.3.5 Analysis	3-16
3.3.6 Technical Support Documents	3-17
4 Industry Profile Development	4-1
4.1 Purpose and Use	4-1
4.2 Structure and Content	4-2
4.3 Data Sources	4-6
4.3.1 The Supply Side	4-10
4.3.2 The Demand Side	4-12
4.3.3 Industry Organization	4-15
4.3.3.1 Market Structure	4-15
4.3.3.2 Manufacturing Plants	4-15
4.3.3.3 Firm Characterization	4-17
4.3.3.4 Other Owning Entities	4-23
4.3.4 Markets	4-24

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONTINUED)

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
5 EIA Analytical Framework and Operational Issues	5-1
5.1 Alternative Approaches for Economic Impact Analysis	5-2
5.1.1 Behavioral vs. Nonbehavioral Models	5-2
5.1.2 Market Model Scope: Partial vs. General Equilibrium	5-3
5.1.3 Length-of-Run Considerations	5-4
5.1.3.1 Very Short Run	5-4
5.1.3.2 Long Run	5-5
5.1.3.3 "Intermediate" Run	5-6
5.1.4 Static vs. Dynamic Models	5-7
5.1.5 Standard Approach for ISEG Industry-Level Analyses	5-7
5.2 PEIS Modeling Approach: Conceptual Framework	5-8
5.2.1 Facility-Level Effects	5-8
5.2.2 Market Effects	5-11
5.2.3 Facility-Level Response to Compliance Costs and New Market Prices	5-13
5.3 PEIS Modeling Approach: Operational Issues	5-14
5.3.1 Baseline Characterization	5-15
5.3.1.1 Producer Characterization	5-16
5.3.1.2 Market Characterization	5-18
5.3.1.3 Characterizing Impacts Outside a Market Setting ...	5-19
5.3.2 Regulatory Control Costs	5-20
5.3.3 Modeling Economic Behavior	5-24
5.3.3.1 Supply Characterization and Responses	5-24
5.3.3.2 Demand Characterization and Responses	5-32
5.3.3.3 Determine With-Regulation Equilibrium	5-36
5.4 Economic Impact Results	5-37
5.4.1 Market-Level Results	5-37
5.4.2 Industry-Level Results	5-37
5.4.3 Company-Level Impacts	5-42
5.4.4 Community-Level Impacts	5-44
5.4.5 Social Costs of the Regulation	5-44
5.4.5.1 Producer and Consumer Surplus Measures	5-45
5.4.5.2 Other Elements of Social Costs	5-48

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONTINUED)

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
6	Impact Analyses 6-1
6.1	The Unfunded Mandates Reform Act (UMRA) 6-1
6.2	The Regulatory Flexibility Act (RFA) and Small Business Regulatory Enforcement Fairness Act (SBREFA) 6-4
6.3	The Paperwork Reduction Act (PRA) 6-10
6.4	Distributional Impacts 6-12
6.5	Structural Impacts 6-14
7	Framework for Quantitative Benefits Analysis 7-1
7.1	Economic Benefits: An Overview 7-2
7.2	Steps in Conducting Benefits Analysis 7-4
7.2.1	Identifying Benefits 7-4
7.2.2	Quantifying Benefits 7-7
7.2.2.1	Quantifying Health Benefits 7-7
7.2.2.2	Quantifying Ecological Benefits 7-10
7.2.2.3	Quantifying Benefits through Nonliving Systems ... 7-11
7.2.3	Monetizing Benefits 7-11
7.2.3.1	Monetizing Health Benefits 7-12
7.2.3.2	Monetizing Ecological Benefits and Benefits to Materials and Structures 7-18
7.2.3.3	Benefit Values per Unit of Emissions 7-20
7.3	Benefits Transfer 7-23
8	General Methodological Issues 8-1
8.1	Specifying the Time Period of Analysis 8-1

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONTINUED)

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
8.2 Specifying a Baseline for Analysis	8-3
8.2.1 Forecasting Economic Activity in the Absence of the Regulation	8-4
8.2.2 Assessing the Rate of Compliance with Existing Regulations ..	8-5
8.2.3 Anticipating Future Regulatory Actions by Other Federal Agencies, by Other Offices within the Agency, and by State, Local, and Tribal Governments	8-6
8.2.4 Anticipating Nonregulatory Factors	8-7
8.2.5 Developing a Starting Point for the Baseline	8-7
8.3 Discounting Benefits and Costs	8-8
8.3.1 Basic Considerations in Discounting	8-9
8.3.1.1 Discounting and Private Decisions	8-10
8.3.1.2 Discounting and Public Policy Decisions	8-12
8.3.2 The Two-Stage Discounting Procedure	8-14
8.3.3 Discounting Issues Deserving Further Attention: Nonmonetized Benefits and Long Time Horizons	8-17
8.3.4 Discount Rates and the Capital Costs of the Regulation	8-18
8.3.4.1 Conceptual Issues	8-19
8.3.4.2 Estimating Capital Costs in Economic Impact Analysis	8-20
8.3.4.3 Reconciling Social Costs in an EIA with "True" Social Costs	8-22
8.3.4.4 Practical Concerns for the Policymaker and Analyst ..	8-29
8.3.5 Empirical Evidence on Discount Rates	8-30
8.3.5.1 Consumption Rate of Interest	8-31
8.3.5.2 Rate of Return on Private Capital	8-31
8.3.6 Discounting Recommendations	8-31
8.4 Addressing Uncertainty	8-33
9 Communicating the Results of the Economic Analysis	9-1
9.1 Communication Goals, the Audience, and Challenges	9-2

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONTINUED)

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
9.2 Key Principles of Clear and Effective Communication	9-3
9.3 A Note on Visual Communication	9-7
References	R-1

LIST OF FIGURES

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
2-1 Sequence of Questions for Determining the Necessary Impact Analyses	2-10
3-1 EPA Regulatory Development Process	3-2
3-2 Flow of Analytical Information in Regulatory Development	3-8
3-3 Main Activities Within ISEG in the Regulatory Development Process	3-14
4-1 Possible Ownership Configurations in U.S. Industries	4-18
5-1 Full-Cost Pass-Through of Regulatory Costs	5-5
5-2 Partial-Cost Pass-Through of Regulatory Costs	5-7
5-3 Product Supply Function at Facility	5-10
5-4 Effect of Compliance Costs on Product Supply Function at Facility	5-11
5-5 Market Equilibrium Without and With Regulation	5-12
5-6 Actual and Annualized Estimates of Compliance Costs	5-23
5-7 Horizontal Supply Curve	5-25
5-8 Upward-Sloping Supply Curve	5-28
5-9 Step Supply Function	5-28
5-10 Regulation-Induced Cost Shifts by Supply Characterization	5-33
5-11 Demand Curves	5-34
5-12 Sensitivity of Changes in Producer and Consumer Surplus to the Elasticity of Demand (Elasticity of Supply = 1.0)	5-36
5-13 Market Outcomes with Nonparallel Supply Shift	5-40
5-14 Economic Welfare Changes with Regulation: Consumer and Producer Surplus	5-47
7-1 Functional Relationships in Benefits Analysis	7-3
7-2 Functional Relationships Between NO _x Emissions and Environmental Service Flows	7-6
9-1 Net Benefits of Regulatory Alternatives	9-8

LIST OF TABLES

<u>Section</u>		<u>Page</u>
1-1	Information Provided by Different Types of OAQPS Economic Analyses	1-3
2-1	Statutes and Executive Orders Requiring Economic Analyses	2-3
2-2	Economic Analysis Requirements Under EO 12291 and EO 12866	2-7
4-1	Annotated Industry Profile Outline	4-3
4-2	List of Industries with EPA Sector Notebooks	4-8
4-3	Summary of Sources for Supply-Side Characterization	4-11
4-4	Summary of Sources for Demand-Side Characterization	4-14
4-5	Data Elements for Facility-Specific Sources	4-16
4-6	Summary of Company-Specific Sources	4-20
4-7	Data Elements for Company-Specific Sources	4-21
4-8	Summary of Sources to Characterize Other Owning Entities	4-25
4-9	Summary of Market-Level Data Sources	4-26
5-1	Baseline Characterization of U.S. Amino and Phenolic Resin Markets: 1991	5-15
5-2	Required Compliance Cost Elements for Affected Entities	5-21
5-3	Summary of Market-Level Impacts of the Proposed Polymers and Resins III NESHAP: 1991	5-38
5-4	Summary of National-Level Industry Impacts of the Proposed Polymers and Resins III NESHAP: 1991	5-39
5-5	Distribution of Industry-Level Impacts of Proposed NESHAP by Affected and Unaffected Producers: 1991	5-41
5-6	Distribution of Social Costs Associated with the Proposed Polymers and Resins III NESHAP: 1991	5-46
6-1	Recommended Quantitative Criteria for Evaluating the Economic Impact of a Rule on Small Entities	6-6
6-2	Summary of Quantitative Information Used to Identify Applicable Categories	6-8
6-3	Contents of the Supporting Statement for an Information Collection Request	6-11
7-1	Applicability of Valuation Methods to Assess Categories of Ecological Benefits	7-18

LIST OF TABLES (CONTINUED)

<u>Section</u>		<u>Page</u>
7-2	Examples of Estimated Value per Mg for Selected Pollutants (1996\$)	7-21
7-3	Estimates of the Global Social Costs of Greenhouse Gas Emissions	7-22
8-1	Transformation of Social Costs from an EIA to BCA	8-32
9-1	Identified, Quantified, and Monetized Health Effects	9-5
9-2	Sample Table of Net Benefits Estimates— Annual Net Benefits of Regulatory Options	9-6